

## EASTERN HEALTH BOARD

*Minutes of Proceedings of Monthly Meeting of Eastern Health Board held in the Boardroom, St. Brendan's Hospital, Grangegorman. on Thursday 7th July. 1977 at 6.45 p.m.*

### *Present*

Councillor Mrs. J. Barlow	Dr. D. G. Kelly
Dr. J. D. Behan	Councillor Denis Kinsella
Councillor M. Brady	Deputy T. Leonard
Councillor D. Browne	Dr. P. McCarthy
Councillor M. Carroll	Sr. Columba McNamara
Councillor J. Connolly	Dr. A. Meade
Mr. H. Corrigan	Mr. B. Mulledy
Councillor O. Cooney	Deputy Dr. J. O'Connell
Professor J. S. Doyle	Mr. F. O'Mahony
Councillor J. Durning	Dr. B. Powell
Councillor Mrs. A. Glenn	Dr. B. Sheehan
Councillor A. Groome	Councillor J. Sweeney
Mr. K. Harrington	Dr. J. Walker
Councillor P. Hickey, P.C.	Dr. M. Walsh

Councillor P. Hickey, Chairman, presided.

### *Apology for Absence:*

Ms. Noreen Kearney.

### *Officers in Attendance:*

Mr. E. O Caoimh	<i>Chief Executive Officer</i>	Prof. Ivor Browne
Mr. J. J. Nolan	<i>D/Chief Executive Officer</i>	Mr. J. Doyle
Mr. T. Keyes	<i>Programme Manager</i>	Mr. H. Dunne
Mr. F. Donohue	<i>Programme Manager</i>	Mr. A. O'Brien
Prof. B. O'Donnell	<i>Dublin Medical Officer</i>	Mr. E. Butler
Mr. J. Sadlier	<i>Technical Services Office</i>	Miss L. O'Kelly
Mr. J. F. Reynolds	<i>Finance Officer</i>	Mr. K. Quinn
Mr. R. N. Lamb	<i>Personnel Officer</i>	Miss K. Dolan
Mr. F. Elliott	<i>Planning &amp; Eval. Officer</i>	Mr. E. Dunphy
Mr. F. McCullough	<i>General Administrator.</i>	Mr. T Barry
		Miss E. Larkin

**80/77 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES**

The minutes of the monthly meeting held on 2nd June, 1977, having been circulated, were confirmed on the proposal of Councillor Carroll seconded by Councillor Sweeney.

**(a) Matters arising:**

Or. Walker enquired if it were possible to have Dr. Jennings on the St. James's Hospital Board and it was agreed to examine this question and to advise the Board of the situation. Or. O'Connell questioned why reports of the St. James's Board were not circulated at regular intervals to Board Members and stated that it was desirable to get at least three such reports per annum.

In reply Mr. Nolan pointed out that as originally decided by the Board, he reported as necessary on matters pertaining to St. James's Hospital, with a summary report annually. Professor Doyle and Dr. Meade stated that the hours at which St. James's Board meetings were held were totally unsuitable for a busy professional man and that unless some times suitable to their professional needs were agreed for meetings, they would have to consider resigning from the Board. When Councillor Connolly suggested that a Visiting Committee on the lines of the Board's Visiting Committees should be set up Mr. Nolan stated that this proposal was included in the recommendations of the Hospitals Committee which were on the agenda for discussion and had already been adopted at his request by the St. James's Board. Councillor Browne, Or. McCarthy, Dr. Walsh and Councillor Sweeney also contributed to the debate.

**81/77****PROCEEDINGS OF VISITING COMMITTEES**

- (a) No. 1 Visiting Committee meeting held at Vergemount Hospital, Clonskeagh on 23rd June, 1977— noted.
- (b) No. 2 Visiting Committee meeting held at Usher's Island Hostel (Forensic) on 18th May, 1977—noted.
- (c) No. 2 Visiting Committee meeting held at St. Patrick's Home on 21st April, 1977.

Mr. Corrigan referred to the resubmission of the report of the St. Patrick's Home Visiting Committee in order to have omissions and inaccuracies in the original draft corrected. He mentioned the view held that meetings with officials of the Department of Health in relation to the institution should not

be held without members of the Visiting Committee being in attendance and that babies should continue to be delivered at the Home in order to ensure confidentiality for the unmarried mother. Dr. Walker concurred with Mr. Corrigan as did Dr. O'Connell and Councillor Browne. Mr. Nolan, Deputy Chief Executive Officer, pointed out that hitherto it had not been Board policy to involve members in all such meetings, because of their frequency and the length of time involved and because inevitably if it involved policy and/or finance the outcome of the meeting had to come before the Board for ratification. If however, the Board now wished to involve members in those meetings, arrangements could be made to send necessary notification to the members concerned and to inform the Department accordingly. Mr. Nolan also stated that until the Board decided otherwise, there would be no change in the present arrangements for delivery of babies in St. Patrick's Home. He had already impressed his views in that regard based on the contrary opinion of Dr. Hanratty, Consultant Obstetrician and of medical officers of the Department of Health apart from the cost factor involved. Dr. McCarthy and Dr. Kelly expressed agreement with Dr. Hanratty's view that delivery of babies should not take place in St. Patrick's Home.

(d) No. 3 Visiting Committee meeting held at County Hospital, Naas, on 22nd June, 1977.

Councillor Brady made a plea for the appointment of a Registrar to the Naas Hospital and he was informed that as soon as Dr. Waldron submitted certain necessary medical information, the matter would be taken up with the Department at once. Some of the members attributed the lack of adequate and suitable medical staff to this situation and others to a lack of any rotation scheme with another hospital. Mr. Nolan stated that the position of the smaller hospitals in relation to medical staffing was tending to become more difficult because of the requirements of Comhairle na nOspideal, and he was trying to ease the situation for St. Columcille's and Naas Hospitals by creating links with St. Vincent's and St. James's respectively, while maintaining maximum possible autonomy. Councillor Cooney, Professor Doyle, Dr. Kelly and Dr. McCarthy also contributed to the debate.

82/77

#### PROCEEDINGS OF LOCAL HEALTH COMMITTEES

The Minutes of the following Local Health Committees having been circulated were dealt with as follows:—

- (a) Dublin County Local Health Committee meeting held on 7/6/1977—Noted.
- (b) Dun Laoghaire Local Health Committee meeting held on 31/5/1977—Noted.

Councillor Duming raised the question of adequate notices at the Hearth Centre/Community Care Centre, Dun Laoghaire and was assured that this matter was being dealt with. Arising from the consideration of the above minutes Dr. Sheehan expressed the view that the work of Local Health Committees was treated rather lightly by the Board and suggested that the holding of Board elections and Local Health Committee elections recently at more or less the same time tended to create confusion in the minds of candidates and voters. He was informed that this matter was the subject of discussion with the Department of Health currently.

83/77

**AUDIT OF ACCOUNT FOR YEARS 1973/4 and 1974 and  
REPORT NO. 23/1977.**

The report of the Auditor for the above years and the following Report No. 23/1977 from the Deputy Chief Executive were discussed:—

"I submit report of the Local Government Auditor on the audit of the accounts of the Eastern Health Board for the two financial periods ended 31st December, 1974.

The Auditor refers to certain shortcomings in the system of internal control. Increasing pressure of work in the Finance Department, including the computer section, coupled with staff changes at both senior and junior level allowed little time to tackle the problems involved during the period under audit. Since then, particularly since the appointment of the present Financial Accountant and the Senior Executive Officer, Accounts Section in January 1976 considerable progress has been made.

The internal audit department has been strengthened recently by the appointment of an additional assistant section officer.

The dispute between the Dublin Corporation and the Board regarding the recoupment of salaries of health inspectors engaged on sanitary duties has been satisfactorily resolved and the arrears paid."

Dr. O'Connell raised the question of the non-payment of arrears from the date of application in the case of the hand-capped children's allowance and suggested that the allowance should be paid from the date of application and not from the date of certification as had become the custom of the Board. He then put down a motion which the Chairman ruled out of order under Article 33 of the Standing Orders and which it was agreed should be before the Board at its August meeting. Councillor Durning, Councillor Mrs. Glenn, Dr. Behan and Mr. O'Mahony contributed to the debate and Mr. Donohue replied to the points raised. At Mr. O'Mahony's request it was agreed that a copy of the Estimates for 1977 should be circulated to new members.

84/77

**REPORT OF HOSPITALS COMMITTEE RE GENERAL  
HOSPITAL DEVELOPMENT**

The following Report No. 24/1977 from the Deputy Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"Members: Mr. D. O'Flynn; Dr. J. Mahon; Professor J. S. Doyle; Councillor P. Hickey; Councillor H. P. Dockrell.  
Mr. J. J. Nolan. Deputy C.E.O.; Mr. K. Quinn, S.E.O.

At the meeting of the Eastern Health Board on 4th November, 1976 I informed the Board of current developments and implications involved in the proposals for fusion of the Federation Hospitals and St. James's Hospital as discussed at a joint meeting in Sir Patrick Dun's Hospital on 18th October, 1976. The proposals and related issues were referred by the Board to the Hospitals Committee for examination and report.

The first meeting of the Committee was held on 24th November, 1976 with subsequent meetings on 14th December, 1976, 18th January, 1977, 22nd February, 1977 and 29th March, 1977. Among documents considered by the Committee were:—

1. The Discussion Document on future arrangements for co-ordination of hospitals in the Eastern Health Board area issued by the Department of Health on 19th May, 1976 and Eastern Health Board Report No. 50/1976 (28/10/1976) in that regard.
2. The Statutory Instruments relative to St. James's Hospital Board Establishment Order (S.I. 187 of 1971), James Connolly Hospital Board Establishment Order (S.I. 97 of 1971) and to functions of a Regional Hospital Board (S.I. 164 of 1972).
3. Memoranda dated 21st September, 1976, October 4th 1976, 6th October, 1976 and 11th November, 1976 prepared by the Federated Hospitals in relation to the corporate plan for the Federation and St. James's.
4. Agreement (1972) between St. James's Board and T.C.D. in relation to the Medical School.
5. Chubb Report on co-ordinating committees for North Side and South Side Hospitals in the Eastern Health Board area.

The principal conclusions/recommendations of the Committee were as follows:—

- (a) To endorse the advice in Report No. 50/1976 in relation to the Department's Discussion Document viz.
  - (i) continuation of the managements of the four major hospitals (Mater, James Connolly, St. Vincents and St. James's)—St. James's Hospital to incorporate Sir Patrick Dun's, Baggot St. and Mercer's in due course.
  - (ii) Establishment of new boards of management for the projected hospitals at Beaumont (to incorporate St. Laurence's and Jervis Street) and at Tallaght (to incorporate Adelaide and Meath).
  - (iii) Establishment of two co-ordinating bodies— . one for the major hospitals located in North Dublin and one for the major hospitals located in South Dublin. If the creation of statutory bodies would not be opportune as suggested in the Discussion Document, the alternatives would be to proceed by way of formal agreements.

- (iv) Provision should be made for adequate representation of the Eastern Health Board on all the Boards involved.
- (v) The Eastern Health Board as the statutory body responsible for the provision of the health services in the area should have the function of servicing the co-ordinating body or bodies and should be given the resources to enable it to perform the function. It is vitally important to have co-ordination of acute hospital services with other institutional services and with community care services.
- (b) In the composition of the North Side Committee and of the South Side Committee as set out in the Discussion Document under option 2, consideration should be given to the nomination of more than three Eastern Health Board members on each committee and to representation for maternity hospitals, childrens hospitals and for the interim Boards of the new Beaumont and Tallaght hospitals. It was also considered that the R.C.S.I. nominee should be from the Medical School, recommended by the Faculty and appointed by the Council.
- (c) In relation to the proposed composition of the St. James's Hospital Group Board it was considered that as the future development of Meath and Adelaide Hospitals was linked with the proposed new Hospital in Tallaght and as Harcourt Street was linked with Our Lady's Hospital, Crumlin, none of the three hospitals concerned should have a separate nominee on the Group Board.
- (d) The Eastern Health Board representation on the Group should continue at 10 members.
- (e) The total membership of the Group Board should not exceed 22, i.e. 10 Eastern Health Board, 2 T.C.D., 6 staff, 4 hospitals (Steevens, Mercer's, Sir Patrick Dun's and Baggot Street).
- (f) The present arrangement as fixed by the Minister's Order of rotating the Chairmanship and Vice-Chairmanship each year between an Eastern Health Board

nominee and a non-Eastern Health Board nominee should be continued.

- (g) St. James's Board should set up a Visiting Committee for the hospital similar to those used for the Eastern Health Board institutions. The reports of the Committee should be made available regularly to the Eastern Health Board.
- (h) It was noted that the agreement between St. James's Hospital Board and T.C.D. did not preclude the attendance of students of other medical schools, such as R.C.S.I. at St James's Hospital. In that regard it was considered that a formal agreement similar to that between St James's and T.C.O. should be arranged between R.C.S.I. and James Connolly Hospital Board.
- (i) The development and organisation of the health services would be greatly assisted by a more positive involvement therein of the Dublin Regional Hospital Board and strengthening of its complementary role vis-a-vis Comhairle na n-Ospideal.
- (j) The Eastern Health Board should nominate the necessary number of members, with at least one officer, to fill the position available to the Board on the Central Council of the Federated Hospital Group.
- (k) The special facilities available in St. James's Hospital for care of the aged and for maternity and paediatric cases should be retained and developed there until such time as adequate alternative facilities, acceptable to the Eastern Health Board are provided at suitable locations within the area.
- (l) Special efforts should be made to provide adequate bed and related facilities for terminal care sick, young chronic sick and/or disabled including multiple sclerosis, R.T.A. cases, strokes, etc.
- (m) It was very desirable to obtain some beds in Leopardstown Park Hospital for geriatric cases in view of the acute shortage of continuing care beds in South Dublin.
- (n) The Department should be requested to increase the amount which the Board is authorised to pay as a subvention to long-stay patients who are being accommodated in recognised homes in the area.



- (o) The provision of diagnostic day facilities and of special day and five-day units was an important element in the development of the health services and the Department should be requested to expedite such provision. In that regard generally it was considered that the new Directors of Community Care should relate closely to the major hospitals in the respective areas and should also consider an arrangement whereby Hospital Consultants would visit Area Health Centres on a regular basis.
- (p) Adequate dental treatment facilities should be provided in general hospitals pending a possible centralised unit in St. James's Hospital.
- (q) The Board should encourage the development of closer links and involvement with continuing care institutions such as the Royal Hospital, Our Lady's Hospice, Simpsons, etc., as it is obvious that the demand for accommodation in such institutions is rapidly increasing."

In submitting the Report Mr. Nolan, Deputy Chief Executive Officer, gave the members a brief review of the hospital situation to date and of the general course of likely future developments. He drew special attention to many of the recommendations contained in the Report and in that regard the Board decided unanimously to retain nomination of at least 50% of the membership of the St. James's Hospital Board should any reconstruction of that Board be envisaged. He also informed the Board that:—

- (i) 1977/78 was a year in which one of the nominees of the Eastern Health Board to the St. James's Hospital Board was entitled under the Establishment Order to be elected as Chairman of the Hospital Board for 1977/78 at the Annual General Meeting to be held at the Hospital on Friday, July 29th, 1977.
- (ii) On the basis of reports already made to the Board and of a letter dated July 4th, 1977 from Professor Neale of St. James's to Professor Brendan O'Donnell, Dublin Medical Officer, and subject to specific guarantees from Harcourt Street that they would make an adequate substitute paediatric service available, the present small paediatric unit

at St. James's should be phased out. The existing neo-natal unit attached to the Maternity Department in St. James's Hospital will continue in operation.

- (iii) He had made an interim arrangement for a Board representative on the Harcourt Street Committee and had requested Our Lady's Hospital, Crumlin allot two places on their Board to Eastern Health Board nominees in order to ensure adequate involvement in the provision of paediatric services in a centralised situation.
- (iv) It appeared likely from a report by the Principal of the Dublin School of Physiotherapy, which is based in St. James's that the School was likely to have to close in the near future because of lack of teachers.
- (v) A special committee of the Hospital Board had reported that there was a very serious shortage of physiotherapists in the Hospital.
- (vi) In view of the dilapidated condition of the former Coombe Hospital premises, the elderly patients who were at present accommodated there would be transferred to the Weir Home in Cork Street (opposite Bru Chaoimhin). The transfer would take place as soon as the St. James's Hospital student nurses who now occupied the premises obtained alternative accommodation (possibly at Cherry Orchard).
- (vii) It would be desirable to seek nomination of five representatives of the Board to act during the pre-commissioning stage of the new Beaumont Hospital (instead of the three suggested in the draft order) enclosed with Dr. Hensey's letter of May 16th 1977.
- (viii) In the discussions with St. Vincent's Hospital, Elm Park in relation to co-operation with St. Columcille's, the Department of Health were now taking part officially and had requested the involvement also of St. Michael's Hospital, Dun Laoghaire

- (ix) At the request of Comhairle na nOspideal, future arrangements for the provision of services for S.T.D. on the south side were being discussed with representatives of the Board, of the Department and of the Federation.

Or. Sheehan, Councillors: Durning, Carroll, Connolly, Or. Meade. Dr. Kelly, Or. Powell and Councillor Sweeney contributed to the ensuing debate following which it was agreed to defer the report for a further consideration to the August meeting and in relation to items (iv) and (v) to inform the Department of their concern at the physiotherapy position in St. James's Hospital and request urgent remedial measures and request five representatives on the Beaumont Board as suggested in (vii).

85/77

#### SALE OF DISPENSARY AT BALLSBRIDGE

The following Report No. 20/1977 from the Deputy Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"Allied Irish Banks Ltd., which is building its head office complex on lands at the rear of the Board's health centre at 38, Merrion Road, Ballsbridge, has applied to the Board to purchase the health centre so as to incorporate the site into the complex. The health centre is a two-storey building and contains two large and four small rooms, together with a medium sized waiting room. There is a small narrow land-locked garden at the rear of the health centre.

The total site area is approximately 29 perches. The property is held in fee simple, the freehold interest having been acquired in 1976. (It had been leased from the Pembroke Estate from 25th March 1867 for a period of 150 years). A map showing the property will be submitted to the meeting.

Alternative accommodation is available for the services and for the staff providing them at the health centre. The Chief Valuer, Dublin Corporation, has valued the health centre at £140,000. Allied Irish Banks Ltd., have accepted the valuation and have agreed to pay this sum on the condition that the Board will be responsible for payment of the Stamp Duty on the transfer of the premises. The Chief Valuer agrees.

I propose, subject to the sanction of the Minister for Health to dispose of the Health Centre at 38, Merrion Road to Allied Irish Banks Ltd., on the terms agreed. This report is submitted in accordance with the requirements of Section 83 of the Local Government Act, 1946.

Section 83 provides that at the first meeting of the Eastern Health Board held after the expiration of ten clear days from the date of circulation of this report the Board may resolve that the disposal of the property as proposed shall not be carried out or that it shall be carried out in accordance with the terms specified in the resolution. If the Board resolve that the disposal shall not be carried out it shall not be carried out. On the other hand, if the Board does not pass a resolution as to the manner in which the disposal shall be carried out, the disposal, may, with the consent of the Minister for Health, be carried out in the manner set out above."

Or. Walker expressed the view that the Board should retain this property for possible future development and Dr. Meade concurred with this view. Mr. Donohue, programme manager, explained to the members that the matter was rather urgent and that alternative premises would be available within four weeks in the opinion of the Technical Services Officer Mr. Sadlier. Mr. Corrigan proposed and Professor Doyle seconded the following motion:—

'That the proposals outlined in Report No. 20/1977 be adopted:—

The motion was carried by 17 votes to 4 the voting being as follows:—

FOR: Dr. Behan; Councillors: Carroll; Connolly; Mr. Corrigan; Councillor Cooney; Professor Doyle; Councillor Durning; Councillor Mrs. Glenn; Councillor Hickey; Dr. Kelly; Dr. McCarthy; Sr. Columba; Mr. Mully; Mr. O'Mahony; Dr. Powell; Dr. Sheehan; Councillor Sweeney.

AGAINST: Councillor Mrs. Barlow; Mr. Harrington; Dr. Meade; Dr. Walker.

Dr. Behan and Mr. O'Mahony also took part in the discussion.

86/77

**COUNTY WICKLOW ASSOCIATION FOR MENTALLY  
HANDICAPPED—PROVISION OF SITE FOR SPECIAL  
SCHOOL**

The following Report No. 21/1977 from Mr. T. Keyes, Programme Manager, Special Hospital Care, was submitted:—

"Prior to the establishment of the Board in April, 1971, Wicklow County Council as the Mental Health Authority for Co. Wicklow by resolution agreed to make a site available to the Co. Wicklow Association for the Mentally Handicapped for the building of a new school subject to the Association's making application for and receiving Departmental recognition of the school as a National School. Since that time, the School has grown in size from a two-teacher school catering for 20 pupils to a three-teacher school providing education for 35 pupils. The Department of Education has also accorded full recognition of the school.

It was always accepted by the parties to the present arrangement that the Staff Home at Newcastle Hospital was not a suitable location for the school in question and Wicklow County Council in granting permission to the Association to use part of the Staff Home for this purpose merely wished to afford an opportunity to the Association to provide a school on a trial basis. The need for the availability of this service on a long term basis has now been clearly demonstrated and the Department of Education and the Association are presently involved in preparing for a purpose-built four-teacher school.

I recommend that the Board honour the commitment entered into by Wicklow County Council by conveying approval in principle to the making available of a site in a mutually acceptable location in the grounds of Newcastle Hospital, the area of the site in question to be determined by reference to the Department of Education guidelines. A formal proposal in accordance with Section 83 of the Local Government Act 1946, will be submitted at a later date."

On a proposal by Councillor Sweeney seconded by Councillor Carroll the following motion was unanimously adopted:—

**'That the Board approve in principle of the allocation of a site for the County Wicklow Association for the Mentally Handicapped at Newcastle Hospital.'**

87/77

**LOCAL HEALTH COMMITTEES**

The members decided that the above Report should be deferred to the August meeting.

88/77

**CORRESPONDENCE**

- (a) Letter dated 7th June, 1977 from the Department of Health regarding development at Peamount Hospital, Newcastle, was read. The members approved of the discussions which had been opened with the Peamount Hospital authorities by the Deputy C.E.O. about their offer to take 50 extra day patients and other allied developments which may ensue.
- (b) Letter dated 1st June, 1977 from the Council for Post Graduate Medical and Dental Education, having been circulated, was discussed. It was agreed that a meeting should be called of the Health Education Committee to discuss this item.
- (c) Letter dated 24th June, 1977 from the Medical Superintendent, St. Ita's Hospital to Mr. Keyes was read informing that the Royal College of Psychiatrists intended to recommend the extension of the professional accreditation of this hospital for a further period. The members noted these developments with satisfaction.
- (d) Letter dated 5th July, 1977 from the Western Health Board containing the following resolution was read:—

**"We again call on the Minister for Health to approve the payment of Department of Social Welfare scale of fees to private dentists providing services to patients eligible for dental treatment under the Health Acts."**

120

7/7/1977

The members unanimously agreed to endorse the resolution.

The meeting terminated at **8.45** p.m.

CORRECT:

**J. J. NOLAN**

*Deputy Chief Executive Officer.*

Signed .....

CHAIRMAN.