

EASTERN HEALTH BOARD

Minutes of Proceedings of Monthly Meeting of the Eastern Health Board held in the Boardroom, St. Brendan's Hospital, Grangegorman, on 3rd January, 1974 at 6 p.m.

Present:

Commissioner J. Berry	Dr. P. C. Jennings
Mr. Michael E. Birmingham	Miss Kay Kinsella
Councillor M. Brady	Miss Mary Lacey
Councillor P. J. Burke	Commissioner Denis Larkin
Councillor M. Carroll	Commissioner Tom Leonard
Dr. Robert Carroll	Dr. James McCormick
Mr. Hugh P. Corrigan	Councillor A. Mahon
Dr. J. Cullen	Dr. J. R. Mahon
Councillor Michael Cunningham	Dr. A. Meade
Deputy H. P. Dockrell	Mr. Dermot O'Flynn
Dr. J. Stephen Doyle	Commissioner James O'Keeffe
Councillor J. Guinan	Mr. Martin Ruane
Mr. Kevin A. Harrington, B.D.S.	Councillor John Sweeney
Commissioner Liam Hayes	Councillor John Temple
Councillor Patrick Hickey, P.C.	Deputy G. Timmins
	Deputy Eugene Timmons
	Dr. John Walker

Apologies for Absence:

Councillor Dr. R. Belton and Mr. J. Corcoran, M.B.

Councillor P. Hickey, Chairman, presided:

Officers in Attendance:

Mr. E. O Caoimh, <i>Chief Executive Officer</i>	Mr. H. Dunne
Professor B. O'Donnell, <i>Dublin Medical Officer</i>	Mr. J. Doyle
Mr. F. J. Donohue, <i>Programme Manager, Community Care</i>	Mr. P. J. Swords
Mr. F. J. Elliott, <i>Planning & Eval. Officer</i>	Mr. J. Clarke
	Mr. F. McCullough
	Mr. P. I. Lyons
	Mr. P. A. Sheehan
	Mr. P. Quinn
	Miss Kay Dolan

1/74 CONDOLENCES

The Chairman advised the members of the deaths of Mr. H. Dunne's brother and of Councillor J. Guinan's uncle. A minute's silence was observed and the members directed that a message of sympathy from them be conveyed to the relatives.

2/74 ILLNESS OF MEMBER

The Chairman advised the meeting that one of the members, Mr. J. Corcoran, M.B., was ill and they directed that their good wishes for his speedy recovery be conveyed to him.

3/74 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Monthly Meeting held on the 6th December, 1973, having been circulated, were confirmed on a proposal by Commissioner L. Hayes, seconded by Commissioner Leonard. Arising from the Minutes the Chairman queried the result of the Board's representatives meeting with the Vocational Education Committee re premises at Blanchardstown. Mr. H. Dunne advised him that they had met representatives of the V.E.C. and it was agreed that the Board should indicate their requirements. This was being done.

4/74 PROCEEDINGS OF COMMITTEES

Reports of the proceedings of the following Committees having been circulated were adopted:—

- (a) *No. 2— Meeting held at St. Patrick's Home on 3rd December, 1973.*
- (b) *No. 3 — Meeting held at St. Gabriel's Day Centre, Clontarf, on 12th December, 1973.*
- (c) *No. 4 — Meeting held at St. Mary's Hospital, Phoenix Park, on 6th December, 1973.*

5/74 FUTURE DEVELOPMENT OF GENERAL HOSPITAL SERVICES

The following Report No. 1/1974 from the Deputy Chief Executive Officer was submitted, together with copy letter of 18/12/73 from Department of Health:—

"On the basis of the Department's letters of October 9th and 18th inst. the procedure with regard to preliminary consideration of the General Hospital Services development will

be as follows: With the issue on 18/12/73 of the Comhairle's report on the future development of General Hospital Services in Dublin the way is now clear for the Secretary of An Comhairle to summon the first meeting of the Working Party set up under the Minister's letter of 9th October. That Working Party, consisting of representatives from the Eastern Health Board (as fixed at the meeting on 7/10/73), Comhairle and D.R.H.B., should now meet and consider the general planning of hospitals in the Dublin area within the parameters laid down in the above report from the Comhairle. (See Page 2 of the Minister's memorandum, paragraph 4, sent out with his letter of October 5th.) When this Working Party has done this largely technical study it will then send a report on the results to each of the bodies concerned, i.e., Health Board, R.H.B. and Comhairle. Each of the latter bodies will then formulate their views on that report and send them to the Minister, but in the case of the Eastern Health Board the report will not be dealt with by them until they have first consulted the Local Health Committees in the area and have obtained their views. When these views have been obtained the Board will then consider the report from the Working Party together with the views of the Health Committees. The Board will then come to a decision and inform the Minister thereof. In any case where a local committee held views different to those of the Board such different views would be forwarded separately to the Minister."

"A Chara,

I am directed by the Minister for Health to refer to the memorandum and guidelines regarding the reorganisation and development of the general hospital system which he issued to the health administrative bodies in October. In the course of the memorandum reference was made to the special complexity of the problem in Dublin and the Minister promised a further statement about this. He has recently received from Comhairle na nOspideal reports made by two sub-committees set up with his approval to explore the possibilities of arriving at a satisfactory basis for general hospital development on the north side and the south side of the City. Copies of these reports are enclosed for circulation to the members of the Board. I am also to enclose copies of a statement being published by the Minister in relation to the reports.

The Minister considers that it would be appropriate to have the reports considered by the joint working group which is due to consider the general hospital development needs in the

Eastern Health Board area. Your Board might subsequently give their comments in accordance with the procedure already recommended.

Mise, le meas."

On a proposal by Councillor J. Guinan, seconded by Deputy H. P. Dockrell, it was agreed to note this report.

6/74 CHOICE OF DOCTOR SCHEME

The following Report No. 2/1974 from the Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"The choice of doctor/chemist scheme has been in operation since 1st April, 1972. A total of 367 doctors (43 of whom opted for salary) and 432 chemists are participating. Eleven medical vacancies have occurred since then. Six of the vacancies were filled by open competition. In three cases the eligible persons concerned were requested to choose another doctor from the list of participating doctors. The remaining two vacancies will be filled by open competition.

The 367 doctors provide the general practitioner service for a total of 204,500 eligible persons. The average number of eligible persons per doctor is 560.

Expenditure on the Scheme

The total cost of the choice of doctor scheme for the year ended 31st March, 1973, was £2,954,000. The six main elements of the cost were:

- (a) The fees for surgery and domiciliary visits payable to doctors who opted for fee per item service.
- (b) The salaries payable to former permanent District Medical Officers.
- (c) The cost of locums who act for permanent District Medical Officers while they are on annual, sick and special (time off) leave.
- (d) The practice expenses (maximum £100 per year per doctor), payable to private general practitioners.
- (e) Grants to doctors who improve their surgeries.
- (f) Administration expenses

Expenditure on the scheme for the period from 1st April, 1973 to 31st October, 1973 was £1,889,000 and the revised estimate for the full year to 31st March next is £3,285,000.

An analysis of the payments to doctors for fee per item service for the month of August, 1973 showed that the earnings fell into the following income ranges:

Up to £250.	157
£251—£500	109
£501—£750.	37
£751—£1,000.	18
£1,001— £1,250	2
Over £1,250	1

Total 324

Payments to chemists for the period 1st April to 31st August, 1973, averaged £370 per chemist per month and this sum includes the ingredient cost of the drugs dispensed, which is at least 70% of the amount paid to Pharmacists.

Medical Cards

At the 31st October, 1972 the total of persons covered by medical cards was 157,000. On the 30th September, 1973 the total had increased (by 30%) to 204,500.

The factors which contributed to this increase are as follows:

1. The revision from 1st April, 1973 of the guidelines for determination of full eligibility.
2. The requirement in Section 45 of the Health Act, 1970 that only the income of the applicant and his spouse may be taken into account when full eligibility is being determined, i.e., the earnings of sons and daughters residing with the applicant are not taken into account.
3. Students of University, Secondary and Technical Colleges who are over 16 years of age and who have no income of their own or whose income does not exceed that laid down in the guidelines are eligible for medical cards.
4. Religious in communities who are unsalaried and in respect of whom the Order receives little or no payment for services given, are deemed to be entitled to full eligibility.

Clerical students are also entitled to full eligibility.

5. Under the E.E.C. Regulations in relation to health services the undermentioned categories of persons are entitled to medical cards:
- (i) A pensioner resident in Ireland who has a British Social Security retirement pension or widows pension, who is not also drawing an Irish Social Welfare Pension,
 - (ii) The dependants of a man who is working in England as an insured person, unless his wife, resident in Ireland, is herself covered by Social Welfare Insurance.

Visiting Patterns

The following table shows the estimated annual consultation of doctors by patients based on the returns for the month of August, 1973. The pattern for November, 1972 is shown for comparison.

Area	Surgery Consultation		Domiciliary Visitation		Total	
	Aug. 1973	Nov. 1972	Aug. 1973	Nov. 1972	Aug. 1973	Nov. 1972
Dublin	5 0 4	6-8	1 17	1-9	6-21	8 7
Wicklow	3-78	4-5	1 0 6	1 8	4-84	6-3
Kildare	3 34	3-5	0-95	1-2	4-29	4-7

It will be noted that while the number of eligible persons increased by 30/.,, the estimated average visiting rate per patient has decreased."

After discussion to which Dr. McCormick, Commissioner Larkin. Commissioner Berry and Mr. H. Corrigan contributed and to which Mr. H. Dunne replied, it was unanimously resolved on a proposal of Mr. Corrigan, seconded by Councillor P. J. Burke, as follows:—

"That Report No. 2/1974 be adopted."

7/74 DISPOSAL OF LAND AT ST. LOMAN'S HOSPITAL

The following Report No. 59/1973 was submitted:—

"A request has been received from Dublin County Council to make available a plot containing about 2-08 acres at St. i. ornan's Hospital, Eallyowen. to enable the construction of an entry road to open up lands owned by Dublin Corporation in

the area. The plot in question, which fronts on to the main Palmerstown-Lucan road and is on the eastern boundary of the Hospital lands, is shown in the map submitted with this report.

The Chief Valuer has reported that the sum of £8,320 is a fair and reasonable price for the plot and has recommended that it be sold for that amount. Subject to the consent of the Board, I propose to seek the sanction of the Minister for Health to the sale of the land to the County Council at the price recommended by the Chief Valuer.

The lands of St. Loman's Hospital, Ballyowen, were vested in Dublin Corporation and were transferred to the former Dublin Health Authority on its establishment and are held by the Board as successor to the latter body. The lands are held in fee simple.

This report is submitted in conformity with Section 83 of the Local Government Act, 1946.

Section 83 provides that at the first meeting of the Eastern Health Board held after the expiration of ten clear days from the date of circulation of this report, the Board may resolve that the disposal of this property as proposed shall not be carried out, or that it shall be carried out in accordance with terms specified in the resolution.

If the Board resolves that the disposal shall not be carried out, it shall not be carried out.

On the other hand, if the Board does not pass a resolution as to the manner in which the disposal shall be carried out, the disposal may, with the consent of the Minister for Health, be carried out in the manner set out above."

On a proposal by Councillor J. Guinan, seconded by Deputy H. P. Dockrell, it was unanimously resolved as follows:—

"That the proposals outlined in Report No. 59/1973 be adopted."

8/74 DISPOSAL OF SITE AT CURLEW ROAD

The following Report No. 58/1973 from the Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"At meeting held on 7th October, 1971 the Board approved of the disposal of 2 roods, 35 perches to the Steering Committee of Mourne Road Parish for the purpose of erecting a centre for retired people and the provision of a girls' club.

The Board accepted my recommendation that the application from the Credit Union for a portion of the site to build offices be met by having rooms reserved for them in the centre to be erected by the Steering Committee.

Dublin Corporation, from whom the Board holds the land on lease, has agreed to the disposal of the plot to the Steering Committee subject to the exclusion of a small portion (approx. 10 perches) to allow of an approach being made by the Credit Union to erect an office on this area of 10 perches.

The Steering Committee are aware of and are satisfied with the area (2 roods 25 perches approx.) allocated to them for their centre. The Credit Union is also satisfied with the area (10 perches approx.) reserved for it should it decide to erect an office there.

The lease to the Steering Committee will include a clause allowing right-of-way and access to the plot reserved for the Credit Union. It will also provide for access by the Credit Union to the common car park.

I propose, therefore, to dispose to the Steering Committee a plot measuring 2 roods 25 perches approximately on the terms set out in Report No. 17/1971, viz., a lease for a period of 10 years at a rent of £1 per annum, the plot to be vested in the Diocesan Trustees, the St. Laurence Trust.

This report is submitted in accordance with the requirements of Section 83 of the Local Government Act, 1946.

Section 83 provides that at the first meeting of the Board held after the expiration of ten clear days from the circulation of this report the Board may resolve that the disposal of this property as proposed shall not be carried out or that it shall be carried out in accordance with the terms specified in the resolution. If the Board resolve that the disposal shall not be carried out it shall not be carried out.

On the other hand, if the Board does not pass a resolution as to the manner in which the disposal should be carried out the disposal may, with the consent of the Minister for Health, be carried out in the manner set out above."

On a proposal by Mr. D. O'Flynn, seconded by Mr. H. Corrigan, the following motion was unanimously adopted:—

"That the proposals outlined in Report No. 58/1S73 be adopted."

9/74 MEATH HOSPITAL BOARD—FILLING OF
VACANCIES

The following Report No. 3/1974 from the Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"Under the Health Act 1970 (Adaptation) Regulations 1972, the Eastern Health Board appoint 11 nominees to the Meath Hospital Board.

For the information of the members the following are its current representatives:—

Alderman Philip A. Brady, T.D., M.P.S.I., P.C., "Santessa",
14, Leicester Ave., Rathgar.

Councillor P. J. Burke, 251, Swords Rd., Santry, Dublin 9.
Councillor John Bofand, 94, Monastery Rd., Clondalkin, Co.
Dublin.

Councillor J. Connolly, 39, Hughes Rd., Walkinstown,
Dublin 12.

Councillor H. P. Dockrell, T.D., 105 Newtownpark Avenue,
Blackrock.

Councillor Miss M. Ennis, Springhill, Garristown, Co. Dublin.
Mr. John J. Hunt, 94, Griffith Ave., Dublin 9.

Mr. Matt Gallagher, Hollywood Rath, Mulhuddart, Co.
Dublin.

Professor Ivor Browne, Chief Psychiatrist, Eastern Health
Board.

It will be noted that there are 2 vacancies, caused by the resignation of the now Taoiseach, Mr. L. Cosgrave, T.D., and Mr. M. Clinton, T.D., Minister for Agriculture.

The Meath Hospital Board have requested that the Board should nominate 2 other persons and it is a matter for the Board to so arrange."

The following persons were nominated to fill two vacancies:—

1. Councillor James Guinan—
Proposed by Deputy Godfrey Timmins.
Seconded by Councillor J. Mahon.
2. Dr. A. McInerney—
Proposed by Councillor P. J. Burke.
Seconded by Councillor J. Guinan.

3. Commissioner J. O'Keeffe—

Proposed by Commissioner L. Hayes.

Seconded by Commissioner D. Larkin.

It was agreed to hold a ballot on the election and Commissioner T. Leonard and Deputy G. Timmins were selected as scrutineers. The result of the voting was: Dr. A. McInerney, 22 votes; Councillor J. Guinan, 20 votes; Commissioner J. O'Keeffe, 16 votes. The Chairman then declared Dr. Angela McInerney and Councillor James Guinan elected.

10/74

EXCESS EXPENDITURE

The following Report No. 4/1974 from the Chief Executive Officer was submitted:—

"Arising out of the decision of the Minister for Health to approve the revision of salary rates and certain allowances with effect from 1st January, 1972 in accordance with the terms of settlement of the Junior Hospital Doctors' dispute, additional expenditure totalling £54,000 in the period to 31st March, 1974, for which provision has not been made in the Estimate, is incurred in respect of such staff employed by the Eastern Health Board.

In addition to the foregoing an Arbitration Award to County Medical Officers and Assistant County Medical Officers, applicable also to Assistant Chief Medical Officers and Assistant Medical Officers, involves expenditure of £36,000 in the period to 31st March, 1974 for which provision has not been made in the Estimate.

Finally, as a result of Labour Court Recommendation No. 3062 back-dating to 1st January, 1973 a 40-hour working week for the Attendants at the Central Mental Hospital, Dundrum, payment at overtime rates for all hours worked in excess of 40 per week since that date has cost an additional £40,000 for which provision has not been made in the Estimate. Recruitment of additional staff is in hand to enable the 40-hour working week to be introduced shortly."

Dr. Walker queried the omission of Senior Medical Officers from the Report and it was explained that it was normal to deal with the basic grades and subsequently negotiate for senior grades and that this was taking place. It was agreed that a report on these grades would be before the Board at its next meeting. Following this discussion the following motion

proposed by Mr. D. O'Flynn, seconded by Commissioner D. Larkin, was unanimously adopted:—

"That we, the Eastern Health Board, consent to the proposals contained in Report No. 4/1974 and authorise the expenditure of **£130,000** in the current financial year in excess of that provided in the Estimate of Expenses for 1973/74 under the following headings:

<i>Service</i>	<i>Purpose of Expenditure</i>	<i>Amount</i>
Health	Board Hospitals—General.	£27,000
	—Psychiatric.	£67,000
	Maternity and Child Health.	£25,000
	Infectious Diseases.	£5,000
	Central Services.	£6,000
		<u>£130,000"</u>

11/74

CORRESPONDENCE

The following letter dated 11th December, 1973 from the Dun Laoghaire Borough Corporation was read:—

"The Borough Council at its meeting on 5.11.73 adopted the following resolution:

That the Eastern Health Board be requested to set up in Dun Laoghaire an administrative office equal in status to that in the pilot scheme project.

After a short discussion it was agreed to refer the matter to Dun Laoghaire Local Health Committee for consideration.

The meeting concluded at 7 p.m.

CORRECT:

EOGHAN O CAOIMH,
Chief Executive Officer.

Chairman