Sleep Paralysis and Hallucinations: What Clinicians Need to Know

Gillian Murphy and Jonathan Egan

Gillian Murphy is currently reading for a MSc in Clinical Neuropsychology in Bristol University. Jonathan Egan is the Principal Clinical Psychologist of the Cardiac Rehabilitation Programme of the Mater Misericordiae University Hospital. Correspondence regarding this article may be addressed to jonathanegan@mater.ie

... she believed the devil lay upon her and held her down, sometimes that she was choked by a great dog or thief lying upon her breast, so that she could hardly speak or breathe, and when she endeavoured to throw off the burden, she was not able to stir.
Van Diemerb roeck, 1 689 (as cited in Kompanje, 2008, pp. 183–185)

The American Sleep Disorder Association (1990) defines sleep paralysis as consisting of an inability to perform voluntary movements either at sleep onset (hypnagogic) or upon awakening either during the night or in the morning (hypnopompic). Often sleep paralysis is accompanied by various types of hallucinations and these are often in the presence of intense fear. These phenomena, however, are not always necessarily of a frightening nature (Cheyne, Newby-Clarke, & Rueffer, 1999a). They can last from a few minutes to 20 minutes. The individual feels as if they are conscious and they often take in the “real in their environment” and this becomes intermixed with their hallucination.

Early reported prevalence rates vary from 3 to 62% (Cheyne et al., 1999a). These prevalence figures in the literature are misleading, as the figures usually refer to sleep paralysis unaccompanied by hallucinations (Cheyne et al., 1999a). Thirty per cent of a sample of university students reported at least one experience of sleep paralysis. Three quarters of those reported at least one hallucinoid experience and approximately 10% experienced three or more hallucinations (Cheyne et al., 1999a). These results are consistent with recent surveys in which prevalence rates of 25 to 40% are reported (Fukuda, Miyasita, Inugami, & Ishihara, 1987; Spanos, McNulty, DuBreuil, Pires, & Burgess, 1995).

Another reason for disparities in prevalence rates in the literature is due to type of descriptions used. Studies using folk expression – such as the old hag phenomenon in Newfoundland, ghost oppression in China and Kanashibari (“the bands”) in Japan – have yielded higher prevalence rates than studies using clinical descriptions which include the paralysis and not the accompanying hallucinations (Jiménez-Genchi, Avila-Rodriguez, Sánchez-Rojas, Vargas Terrez, &
March 2010

psychic or tarot reader they have attended told them that they have experienced childhood sexual abuse at the hands of a close relative. The patients described how they had told the psychic that they had no waking memories of actual abuse, but that they had described hypnagogic or hypnomic hallucinations with sleep paralysis of a figure with no face sitting or hovering near their bed and that they had felt fear and a pressure on their chest – as if someone was lying on them. The psychic’s interpretation was that their father had sexually abused them as a child. This had disastrous effects on the person’s family and their relationship or perception of their relationships with the no-face intruder during their hallucination, which was now reformulated by the psychic as their father. This type of event, however, is not as unusual as one would hope. Browne (2008) recalled that:

> When the silence was finally broken [childhood sexual abuse], this brought in its train a number of over-enthusiastic therapists, counsellors and others. Because those who have been traumatised and abused tend to present with a wide range of symptoms, these therapists saw abuse lurking below the surface in many situations where in fact no such abuse had actually occurred. They actively suggested this to patients and, particularly with the use of methods such as hypnosis, or peer pressure in fundamentalist therapeutic group, highly susceptible subjects complied and others were wrongly accused. (p. 300)

Thus one of the motivations in writing this piece was to warn against the over-interpretation of normal sleep events amongst a clinical population.

A Model of Sleep Paralysis

Cheyne, Reuffer and Newby-Clarke (1999b) developed a three-factor model of hypnagogic and hypnopompic experiences that accompany sleep paralysis. They used the
Waterloo Unusual Sensory Experiences Survey across a number of samples in order to assess the frequency of their events. Exploratory factor analysis resulted in a three-factor model:

1. The first factor was called “Intruder” and it consisted of fear, a sensed presence, and auditory and visual hallucinations.

2. The second factor was called “Incubus” and this consisted of breathing difficulties, feeling pressure on the chest and pain and it was consistent with a physical assault. (Both Intruder and Incubus were moderately correlated with each other and were associated with intense fear)

3. The third factor was called “Unusual Bodily Experiences” and it comprised of “out-of-body” and floating experiences. There was on some occasions a feeling of bliss as opposed to fear associated with this factor.

Cheyne et al. (1999b) suggested that the intruder factor begins with amygdalar activation. This results in a hyper-vigilant state in which the detection threshold for threat and danger is lowered and biased. They argued that most hallucinations were associated with specific physiological conditions identified in REM sleep. Maquet et al. (1996) reported significant activation of the amygdaloid complex during REM dreams. Some Incubus features are similar to REM shallow rapid breathing. Cheyne et al. (1999b) hypothesised that when attempts by the person to control breathing are unsuccessful, the resistance is interpreted as pressure. Increased airflow resistance can result in feelings of choking which can result in panic and efforts to overcome the paralysis.

Cheyne’s (1999b) model proposes hallucinations begin with a sense of a presence which is emotionally salient and this then leads to an effort to support the presence of the feeling with sensory evidence: “I feel terrified and is if something awful is about to happen, therefore I start to scan in my external and internal realities for evidence of such a threat”. The three-factor model is consistent with descriptions of the phenomenon from various cultures. Cheyne (2005) found that the felt presence tends to reduce in frequency over exposure to sleep paralysis events and he confirmed that the intensity of hallucinations also appeared to vary on a continuum.

Cheyne (2003) evaluated the reliability of his three-factor model across a sample of 5,799 participants. Choking and death thoughts were added to the Incubus factor. Four new variables were included in the Unusual Bodily Experiences factor, relabeled as “Vestibular–Motor”. The four new variables were (a) flying, (b) falling, (c) autoscopy and (d) illusionary motor movements. Cheyne proposes the function of the threat activated vigilance system (amygdala) is to clarify ambiguous signs of danger. Cheyne argued that this state is experienced as a threatening sense of presence. Causal modeling suggests the first two factors of Intruder and Incubus are strongly thematically and sequentially linked by the theme of threat and assault, and the third factor, Vestibular-Motor symptoms, is more autonomous.

Cheyne and Girard (2007a and 2007b) in a prospective study of 383 individual descriptions of hallucinations found that felt presence was the core experience of sleep paralysis which then led on to other hallucinoid experiences. Vestibular-motor symptoms were less common than the intruder or incubus hallucinations. The breathing constriction and death thoughts during the felt presence phase contributed to the fear, and finally the breathing difficulties and felt presence were especially associated with pressure and tactile hallucinations. Highly experienced sleep paralysis experiencers had more vestibular-motor hallucinations, maybe suggesting that these people were starting to master their unusual experience.

However, as with all memories, it is probable that with a higher level of emotional valency, we remember that which is more salient. There are many accounts of positive Hypnopompic hallucinations, the present author’s favourite one being the recollection by the neurologist, Oliver Sacks, of his “Mendelssohn awakening” after having been in an accident and spending several weeks in hospital:

A friend brought me a tape recorder, along with a single cassette of the Mendelssohn Violin Concerto. I played this constantly, dozens of time a day, and one morning, in that delicious hypnopompic state that follows waking, I heard the Mendelssohn playing. I was not dreaming but fully aware that I was lying in a hospital bed, and that my tape recorder was by my side. One of the nurses, I thought, must have put it on, as a novel way of waking me up. Gradually I surfaced, the music continuing all the while until I was able to stretch out a sleepy hand to turn the recorder off. When I did this, I found that the machine was off. In the moment of realizing this, and being startled into full wakefulness, the hallucinatory Mendelssohn abruptly ceased. (Sacks, 2007, p. 281)

**Summary**

Sleep paralysis is a relatively common phenomenon. Most people who have experienced paralysis also report hallucinatory experiences. The symptoms appear to cross cultural divides, but the narrative prevalent in a society tends
to dictate the phenomenology of the hallucinations experienced. No epidemiological studies of the phenomena have been completed in Ireland to date. Clinicians need to be aware of the phenomenon and how it can be misperceived as something more malevolent. It would be interesting for future researchers to assess whether our cultural narratives result in higher incidences of fairies, banshees, leprechauns, the devil or a sexual abuser appearing during their hallucinatory experience.

References


Scholarships

Scholarships for European Students through the Erasmus Mundus Masters in Work, Organization and Personnel Psychology

The European Union is increasing its support to the most highly-talented students to take part in joint programmes in Europe. Scholarships are offered to European students that wish to apply for the Masters in a different country to the one in which they have obtained their degree in psychology. For the next course 2010-2011 the EU has a call for scholarships for European students aiming to study at the Masters in Work, Organizational and Personnel Psychology (WOP-P). The call for applications will be open from 20 February to 20 April 2010.

Take advantage of this opportunity and join the European Masters in Work, Organization and Personnel Psychology (www.erasmuswop.org). A double degree in WOP-P can be obtained by studying at least in two of the five European Universities involved in the programme: Universitat de València (Spain) as the coordinating institution, Universitat de Barcelona (Spain), Université René Descartes Paris 5 (France), Alma Mater Studiorum-Università di Bologna (Italy) and Universidade de Coimbra (Portugal). The duration of the programme is two years, with a total workload of 120 ECTS credits distributed in different blocks: a) courses on WOP-P; b) free-choice courses related to WOP-P; c) a Joint Intensive Learning Unit (Winter-School); d) a professional stage; e) research and a master thesis; and f) a professional report integrating research and practice. Students will attend at least two of the partner institutions (Home and Host Universities).

Students from all over the world can participate in the WOP-P programme. Entry requirements are: a) a degree in psychology, the ability to study full-time, a good level in English, and fluency in at least one of the European languages of the Consortium (Spanish, French, Italian, or Portuguese).

More detailed information can be found on the web page of the programme (www.erasmuswop.org) and on the Erasmus Mundus official webpage (http://europa.eu.int/comm/education/programmes/mundus/index_es.html)